

Statewatch c/o MDR
88 Fleet Street
London EC4Y 1DH
office@statewatch.org

Secretary-General Kitack Lim
International Maritime Organization
4 Albert Embankment
London SE1 7SR

29 June 2020

Subject: Open letter asking the International Maritime Organization (IMO) to deregister the Libyan SAR zone

Dear Secretary General Kitack Lim,

After Libya and Malta signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) on 28 May 2020 to provide a bilateral legal basis for unlawful practices, it is urgent for the IMO, as the UN maritime authority, to remove the Libyan SAR zone from official records. Italy also renewed its MoU with Libya in February 2020, despite acknowledging that it was problematic from a human rights perspective. This appeal builds on a submission to the IMO from Italian parties on 31 March 2020 for which the signatories are still awaiting a reply.¹ The complaint raises relevant and contentious points about the underlying irregularity of the Libyan declaration of a SAR zone in December 2017. It highlights the effects that this has had regarding unethical state practices in the Mediterranean Sea. Such practices amount to human rights violations, if not state crimes, that undermine the law of the sea as a universal insurance mechanism for people who are at sea and seafarers in general, as well as resulting in *refoulements* to Libya that are illegal under international law. Policies against so-called irregular migration are being used to dismantle international legal instruments and conventions in pursuit of strategic policy goals (nobody must enter the EU irregularly). This involves using pseudo-legal measures like MoUs to undermine normative frameworks enshrined in hierarchically prevalent national constitutions, international law and human rights conventions.

In concrete terms, apart from the issues raised in the March submission, this request to strike off the Libyan SAR zone from international records relies on the following elements:

- 1) Libya is unsafe and does not offer any safe ports in which to disembark migrants, considering the civil war that is underway and well-documented abuses and violence to which migrant detainees are subjected. This should rule out the possibility of it being assigned a SAR zone.
- 2) The Libyan Coast Guard is notoriously inadequate for the tasks assigned to it, in material and ethical terms. The Libyan MRCC often fails to answer or respond to distress calls; it is coordinated by Italian, Maltese (as has recently emerged) and EU assets; its membership includes people who have been identified as, or have links with, traffickers; ill-treatment of migrants during SAR operations and after “pull-backs” has been reported.
- 3) Even when the Libyan Coast Guard enacts successful rescue operations, they amount to catching fugitives from detention and mistreatment centres, and rescued people are returned

¹ On the submission by the Comitato Nuovi Desaparecidos and Progetto Diritti and Open Arms, see *Esposto all’IMO per demolire l’alibi della zona SAR libica*, 31.3.2020, Emiliano Drudi, *Tempi Moderni*, <http://www.tempi-moderni.net/2020/03/31/esposto-allimo-per-demolire-lalibi-della-zona-sar-libica/> ; reported in English, here <https://www.statewatch.org/analyses/no-360-malta-italy-eu-libya-pushbacks.pdf>

to places in which they experience torture and inhuman and degrading treatment. National and international courts have repeatedly certified this, and the ICC is conducting an investigation for crimes against humanity regarding the treatment of migrants in Libya. As part of the United Nations system, the IMO can consult statements by UNHCR, UN special rapporteurs on human rights and on migrants' rights, IOM and the Council of Europe's Commissioner for Human Rights on these points. They consistently argue that migrants must not disembark in Libya.

4) The IMO declaratory procedure allows states to claim a SAR zone unless other state parties object. This system has been used opportunistically to create a fictional account that allows several states, and the EU, to relinquish their duties under the law of the sea, international, refugee and human rights law. This undermines fundamental principles like the right to life and states' duty to assist rescues (rather than delaying and obstructing them using any available pretext), thereby jeopardising maritime safety. Captains risk suffering negative effects from acting as is prescribed by the law of the sea. They also run the risk of being ordered by MRCCs to deliver people to places where they are likely to be abused. Although they should technically disobey, they face detrimental consequences for doing so.

5) The Libyan SAR zone is being used to justify the criminalisation of NGOs that have taken on a SAR role after the EU relinquished this function and pressured member states that were conducting it to stop, because of migration policy considerations. Beyond legal and ethical issues concerning the regularity of the SAR zone in question, its use to assert a systematic misreading of the law of the sea to benefit EU states and policies entails serial irregularities that should concern the IMO. In concrete terms, SAR zones are not meant to be exclusive, but Italy and Malta are using Libyan authority as a pretext to omit or delay rescues of vessels in distress beyond their own territorial waters, sometimes resulting in deaths. Coast guard authorities from Italy to Malta (and Greece in the Aegean) are often failing to intervene or, notably in recent weeks in Malta and Greece, they have intimidated people and/or sabotaged vessels carrying migrants, also enacting pushbacks from their territorial waters towards Libya and Turkey. The people attempting irregular border crossings may often be refugees, but they must be prevented from accessing relevant procedures, from national and EU institutional viewpoints. The nationality of rescue crews should be irrelevant to the duty to ensure the swift completion of rescue operations. However, nationality is being used as a pretext to keep people who are rescued and the crews saving them at sea for long periods, as a form of punishment and to waste the funds collected by civil society to counteract wilful shortcomings in states' SAR provision. Ships are being confiscated on spurious grounds because they may save people from drowning, and private ships are being hired to enact refoulements by proxy. The Covid 19 crisis appears to have emboldened state parties, which are now using ships as sites to keep people in quarantine at sea. States are not supposed to instrumentally work to make sea crossings more deadly in order to achieve their strategic migration policy objectives.

For the above reasons, and because we believe that the IMO does not appreciate states using its procedures instrumentally to undermine the law of the sea, maritime safety, human rights and international law, the undersigned ask that formal recognition of the Libyan SAR zone be revoked. This would be an important step towards fulfilling the IMO's function to uphold the SOLAS, SAR and UNCLOS conventions, because the EU and its states appear to consciously and insistently work to dismantle the law of the sea in pursuit of their migration policy goals. In the central Mediterranean, it appears obvious that the IMO's recognition of the Libyan SAR zone is used instrumentally for this end. We are aware that IMO does not wish to be pulled into political disputes but feel that this issue falls squarely within its remit as the guardian of the law of the sea at a global level, which is endangered by policies against human mobility.

Yours sincerely,

The undersigned

Groups, associations and networks

Statewatch

Osservatorio Solidarietà della Carta di Milano

Pressenza international press agency

Comitato Verità e Giustizia per i Nuovi Desaparecidos del Mediterraneo

Rete Antirazzista Catanese

Associazione Studi Giuridici sull'Immigrazione (ASGI)

Fondazione E' stato il vento-Per Riace

borderline sicilia

Lasciateci Entrare

Dossier Libia

Forum per Cambiare l'Ordine delle Cose

Associazione Laudato Sì

A Buon Diritto onlus

Borderline-europe

Carovane migranti

ADIF - Associazione Diritti e Frontiere

CADI - Comitato Antirazzista Durban Italia

CIAC - Centro Immigrazione Asilo e Cooperazione

Transbalkanska solidarnost - Transbalkan Solidarity

Open Arms

Open Arms Italia

Sea-Watch e.V.

Kopin, Malta

Migreurop

Gisti (Groupe d'information et de soutien des immigrés), France

Welcome! Initiative, Croatia

Border Crossing Spielfeld, Austria

Spark15, Malta

aditus foundation, Malta

SOS Malta

ERIM, European Irregularized Migration Regime research group, (Croatia - Serbia - Slovenia)

African Media Association Malta

Institute of Race Relations (IRR)

Are You Syrious?

Push-Back Map collective

Vluchtelingenwerk Vlaanderen
Integra Foundation (NGO) Malta
iuventa 10
CISS/Cooperazione Internazionale Sud Sud, Palermo, Italy
Forum Antirazzista Palermo, Palermo, Italy
EMERGENCY ONG ONLUS
Mediterranea Saving Humans
Saving Humans USA
PRO ASYL
Movimento Caschi Bianchi
Cairo Institute for Human Rights Studies (CIHRS)
Belaady Organization for Human Rights (Libya)
Youth Gathering for Tawergha (Libya)
Independent Organisation for Human Rights (Libya)
Aman Organization Against Discrimination (Libya)
Libyan Crimes Watch
Libyan Organization for Legal Aid
Progetto Melting Pot Europa
Casa Memoria Giuseppe e Felicia Impastato
Alarm Phone
Associazione SOS Diritti Venezia
All Included Amsterdam
Kritnet (Netzwerk Kritische Migrations- und Grenzregimeforschung)
Forum Tunisien pour les droits Économiques et Sociaux (FTDES)
Solidarité sans Frontières (Berne/Switzerland)
Rete In Difesa Di
CILIP, Institut für Bürgerrechte & öffentliche Sicherheit e.V.
Rima, Malta
Welcome to Europe network
FOCSIV - Federazioni degli Organismi Cristiani Servizio Internazionale Volontario
Giuristi Democratici
Un Ponte Per
Associazione "Basta torture alle frontiere"

Individuals

Malin Björk, MEP (GUE/NGL), Sweden

Clare Daly MEP (GUE/NGL), Ireland

Mick Wallace MEP (GUE/NGL), Ireland

Miguel Urbán Crespo MEP (GUE/NGL), Spain

Kostas Arvanitis, MEP (GUE/NGL), Greece

Pernando Barrena MEP (GUE/NGL), Spain

Dietmar Köster MEP (S&D), Germany

Cornelia Ernst MEP (GUE/NGL), Germany

Domènec Ruiz Devesa MEP (S&D), Spain

Tineke Strik MEP, Groenlinks (Greens/EFA), Netherlands

Pietro Bartolo MEP (S&D), Italy

Pierfrancesco Majorino MEP (S&D), Italy

Dr. Milan Brglez MEP (S&D), Slovenia

Ann Singleton, Senior Research Fellow, University of Bristol, Co-Chair Statewatch Trustees

Giovanna Procacci, president Osservatorio Solidarietà

Daniela DeBono, Senior Lecturer, University of Malta; Assoc. Prof., Malmö University (on leave)

Prof. Bridget Anderson, Director of Migrations Mobility Bristol (MMB)

Paola Regina, international lawyer

Dr. Victoria Canning, Senior Lecturer in Criminology, University of Bristol

Flore Murard-Yovanovitch, author, journalist

Tony Bunyan, Director of Statewatch

Guido Viale, sociologist

Dr. Yasha Maccanico, Statewatch, University of Bristol School for Policy Studies, MMB

Dr. Madge Dresser, Honorary Professor, Department of Historical Studies, University of Bristol

Anna Polo, editor of *Pressenza Italia*

Stefano Pasta, Post-Doctoral Researcher, Catholic University of Milan

Mariana Gkliati, University of Leiden, Law

Frances Webber, retired immigration lawyer, author, Institute of Race Relations

Daniela Padoan, author, president Associazione *Laudato Si'*

Filippo Furri, Researcher of Anthropology, member of Migreurop

Diego Acosta Arcarazo, Professor in European and Migration Law, University of Bristol

Emilio de Capitani, former secretary of the LIBE Committee (EP), executive director FREE group

Prof. Salvatore Palidda, Università di Genova

Marcello Maneri, Università Bicocca - Milano
Alessandra Mecozzi, Rete - In Difesa Di
Angelo Baracca, Professore a riposo, Università di Firenze
Laura Marcheselli, Firenze
Alistair Drummond Petrie, musician, Castel Volturno
Emilio Drudi, journalist, Comitato Nuovi Desaparecidos
Arturo Salerni, lawyer, President of Comitato Nuovi Desaparecidos
Stefano Greco, lawyer
Marco Antonio Pirrone, Assistant Professor, Sociology, Università di Palermo
Asja Korbar, translator, activist, Croatia
Veronica Rasoli, lawyer, expert in penal law
Manfred Bergmann, CADI, Comitato Antirazzista Durban Italia
Chiara Marchetti, Universities of Milano and Parma
Luca Ciabbari, Università di Milano
Barbara Pinelli, Università di Roma Tre
Jean-Pierre Cassarino, Collegio d'Europa
Elena Fontanari, Università di Milano
Emanuela Dal Zotto, Università di Pavia
Martina Tazzioli, Goldsmiths University of London
Jean-Paul De Lucca, Senior Lecturer in Political and Legal Philosophy, University of Malta
Eline Wærp, University of Malmö
Dr Giacomo Orsini, Université Catholique de Louvain
Barbara Sorgoni, Università di Torino
Sofia Venturoli, Università di Torino
Dr. Antonija Petričušić, University of Zagreb, Law, Croatia
Marijana Hameršak, Senior Research Associate, Institute of Ethnology and Folklore Research, Zagreb
Isabelle Johansson, Lund University, Kristianstad University
Luigi Achilli, European University Institute, Italy
Paola Sacchi, Università di Torino
Céline Cantat, Research Fellow, Sciences Po, Paris
Chris Jones, Project Director, Statewatch
Sara Pozzi, Phd Candidate, University of Manchester
Filippo Miraglia, ARCI, Italy
Amandine Bach, Policy Adviser, GUE/NGL group in the European Parliament
Barbara Spinelli, journalist, former MEP, Italy
Alessandra Ballerini, lawyer and human rights defender, Genova

Marika Surace, lawyer, foro di Milano, human rights defender
Dr Ahmed Zanya Bugre, Foundation for Shelter and Support to Migrants, Malta
Dr Colin Calleja, Office of the Dean, Faculty of Education, University of Malta
Dr Angele Deguara, Junior College, University of Malta
Dr Lidia Demontis, Maritime Logistics, Malta
Erica Schembri, EFL/ESP teacher, Moviment Graffiti member, Malta
Dr Lena Karamanidou, Research Fellow, Glasgow Caledonian University
Stefano Galieni, President ADIF (Associazione Diritti e Frontiere)
Maurizio Acerbo, National Secretary PRC-S.E.
Paul Galea, teacher, secretary Spark 15
Berit Aasen, senior researcher, OsloMet University, Oslo, Norway
Marie Louise Seeberg, Research professor, Oslo Metropolitan University
Natalia Padrón, Vice President of African Media Association Malta
Nello Scavo, journalist, Avvenire
Carola Rackete, Master Mariner
Leila Giannetto, researcher, FIERI, Torino
Marta Esperti, PhD Candidate at Université Sorbonne Paris Nord, Lecturer at Université de Lille
Lorenzo Vianelli, Université du Luxembourg
Silvia Di Meo, PhD candidate Università di Genova
Luca Masera, professor of Penal Law, Università degli Studi di Brescia
Daniel Gyollai, Glasgow Caledonian University
Professor Elspeth Guild, Queen Mary University of London
Dilek Gürsel, GIZ, Sciences Po, Germa
Ester Russo - Sicilia
Soner Barthoma, Uppsala University, Sweden
Maria Pisani, University of Malta
Lorenzo Pezzani, Goldsmiths, University of London
Anna Zinnanti, Sicilia
Eleonore Kofman, Professor, Middlesex University London
Emanuela Roman, Researcher, FIERI, Torino, Italy
Pasqua de Candia, CISS ONG, Palermo Italy
Dr John R Campbell, School of Oriental & African Studies, London
Dr Agnieszka Kubal, Lecturer, University College London, United Kingdom
Dr Annalisa Meloni, University of East London
Dr Liam Thornton, University College Dublin
Maso Notarianni, president Arci Milano, Italy

Fausta Ferruzza, Palermo, Italy
Elena Consiglio, University of Palermo, Italy
Dr Mariagiulia Giuffr , Edge Hill University, UK
Olga Kravets, documentary photographer and filmmaker
Muhammad al-Kashef - Consultant researcher and advocate
Alan Desmond, Leicester Law School
Maria Valeria Ferruzza, Napoli, Italy
Daniele Biella, journalist, teacher in the project 'Con Altri Occhi'
Emilia Ferruzza - Padova - Italy
Dott. Francesco M.G. Ferruzza- Palermo - Italy
Niels W. Frenzen, Clinical Professor of Law, University of Southern California, Los Angeles USA
Thekli Anastasiou, University of Sheffield
Omer Shatz, international lawyer, Lecturer in International Law, Sciences Po, Paris
Juan Branco, international lawyer
Emilie McDonnell, DPhil in Law candidate, University of Oxford
Diletta Agresta, ASGI, Sciabaca&Oruka
S lvia Morgades-Gil, Lecturer in International Law, UPF, Barcelona.
Dr Maurice Stierl, University of Warwick, UK
Dr Chiara Denaro, University of Trento, Italy
Dr. Gerda Heck, Assistant Professor, American University in Cairo, Egypt
Sebastian Benedikt, PhD Candidate University of G ttingen, Germany
Paolo Cuttitta, IDPS, Universit  Sorbonne Paris Nord
Dr. Thomas M ller, Aachen, Germany
Sophie Hinger, Universit t Osnabr ck, Germany
Suzie Crowter, University of Bristol
Samir Sweida-Metwally, Doctoral Researcher, University of Bristol
Karwan Shareef, PhD candidate, School of Law, University of Bristol
Dr Anastasia Tataryn, University of Waterloo Canada
Professor Hariz Halilovich, ARC Future Fellow, Social and Global Studies Centre, Global, Urban and Social Studies, RMIT University, Melbourne
Julia O'Connell Davidson, Professor in Marvic Social Research, University of Bristol
Monique Agius, Malta
Dr. Jana H berlein, Basel
Daniel Bendix, Professor of Global Development, Friedensau Adventist University, Germany
Mark Micallef, Malta
Sonia Camilleri. Malta

Ritianne Ellul, Malta
Monica Ardemagni,
Franca Rovigatti, Roma
Maria Margherita Gaetani di Laurenzana
Michael Grech
Davide Carnemolla, Welcome to Europe network, Italy
Francesca Cerocchi, Roma
Dr Colin Calleja, Dean, Faculty of Education University of Malta. Department of Inclusion and Access to Learning, Faculty of Education University of Malta
Bernard Cauchi, St Albert College, Valletta
Ruth Cauchi, Malta
Marvic Francalanza, UWC Malta Alumni Association
Charlot Cassar, Malta
Dr. Michael Siassi, Hamburg, Germany
Sig.ra Daniela Del Fedele, Morbegno (So), Italia
Giulia Tranchina, Lawyer, Wilson Solicitors LLP, London
Marlène Micheloni, Sociologist, Roma
Marina Ottonello, Genova Italia
Francois Zammit, Malta
Dr. Stefania Placenti, University of Bristol
Dawn Adrienne Saliba, Ph.D., University of Malta
Anna Zammit, Sociology lecturer - Junior College University of Malta.
Prof. Ray Fabri, University of Malta
Marc Tilley, Malta
Michael Deguara, University of Malta
Letizia Palumbo, European University Institute and University of Palermo, Italy.
Daniele Fiorenza, scrittore, Reggio Calabria
Lorella Beretta, journalist, Milano
Maarit Snellman, Teacher, Finland
Juha Airola, Helsinki, Finland
Vanessa Sturn, Austria
Felix Maiwald, Germany
Dr. ir. Brian R. Pauw, Scientist, Berlin, Germany
Nicola Damiano, Bari, Italy
Elena Chiorino, Turin, Italy
Loan Torondel, aid worker, France
Papa Moussa Ba, London

Manuela Garufi, Milan
Enrico Tranchina, Milan
Alessandro Luparello, Palermo, Engineer
Federico Lera, S. Stefano di Magra (SP), Lawyer
Franca Ruolo, Firenze
Maria Luisa Coppo, Torino, Teacher
Luciana Negro, Lipari (ME)
Paola Spinelli, Trieste, Journalist
Anna Maria Osnaghi, Milano
Francesco Moria, Monza, Student
Alessandra Desiderio, Chieti
Maria Vaccaro, Palermo, Teacher
Anna Cariani, Pisa, Journalist
Patrizio Colagiovanni, Frosinone, Factory Worker
Dora Farina, Altamura (BA), Student
Tiziana Carmelitano, Tropea (VV), Lawyer's personal assistant
Annabella Milano, Bologna, Employee
Viviana Valastro, Bergamo, Consultant, expert in migrant minors
Paola Valentini, Genova, Researcher
Albert Mayordomo, Search & Rescue Coordinator, Open Arms NGO, Barcelona
Marioluca Bariona, nurse, Torino
Dr Daniel Ghezelbash, Associate Professor, Macquarie Law School, Australia
David Owen, Professor, University of Southampton
Francesco D'Autilia, ADV Follevola
Ben Cowles, journalist, Morning Star / The Civil Fleet
Steve Peers, Professor of EU, Human Rights & World Trade Law, University of Essex
Jane Kilpatrick, Researcher, Statewatch
Isabel Santos MEP (S&D), Portugal